

Clarifications/Replies to Pre-bid Queries of RFP Nos. 2/2018-19 and 3/2018-19 dated 27.11.2018 for engagement of consultant for “Determination of the efficient Operation and Maintenance costs (Delhi and Mumbai)” and “Allocation of Assets between Aeronautical and Non-Aeronautical activities (Delhi and Mumbai Airport)” respectively

| Name of Bidder | Query No. | RFP Clause | | | Bidders Query | Clarification/Reply |
|--|-----------|--------------------|---------------------------|--|---|--|
| | | Clause No. | Name | Text requiring clarification | | |
| ABPS Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd. | 1 | 2.6.1 (c), Page 13 | Eligibility Criteria | The Applicant should have minimum 10 (ten) professionals as chartered accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant. Or Out of 10 professionals there should be 6 CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant. | The Applicant should have minimum 5 (five) professionals as chartered accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant. Or Out of 5 professionals there should be at least 1 CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant. | Eligibility Criteria is modified as under: 'The Applicant should have minimum 5 (five) professionals out of which there should be at least two CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant firm' |
| Mind Flow Partners | 2 | 2.6 | Eligibility Criteria | | There is no mention of the consortium criteria. Kindly clarify whether consortium is allowed. | Consortium/JVs are not allowed. |
| | 3 | 2.6.1 (d) | Conditions of Eligibility | The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000 (Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. For avoidance of doubt, professional fees here under refers to fees earned by the Applicant for providing advisory or consultancy services to its clients | Financial Turnover may be relaxed to Rs. 1,00,00,000 (Rupees One Crore) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. | Amount of turnover is reduced to Rs 2.5 crores (rupees two crores fifty lakhs) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. |
| | 4 | 2.6.1 (f) & (g) | Conditions of Eligibility | 1. Eligibility criteria for Key Personnel: 2. Availability and eligibility criterion for Aviation Expert | There are two sets of requirements – 1. Financial 2. Aviation Is it possible for a combination of above separately. | Team Leader and one Sector Expert from Finance side should be employee/ partner in the Applicant firm at least for the last one |

| | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|--------------------------|-------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Mind Flow Partners | | | | | | year. Sector Expert for IT field can be an Associate with the Applicant firm for the entire duration of the assignment. However the Applicant firm has to submit copy of the agreement with the Associate firm. |
| | 5 | SCHEDULE-1 Clause - 3 | Scope of Study/ Assignment | | There seems to be an overlap in the scope of work of the two tenders released by AERA – 1. Engagement Of Consultants To Assist The Airports Economic Regulatory Authority Of India (AERA) In The Determination Of The Allocation Of Assets Between Aeronautical And Non-Aeronautical Activities (Delhi And Mumbai Airport) 2. Engagement Of Consultants To Assist The Airports Economic Regulatory Authority Of India (AERA) In The Determination Of Efficient Operation And Maintenance Costs (Delhi And Mumbai Airport) | There is no overlap in two RFPs. |
| | 6 | 2.6 | ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA | | Are international consulting firms allowed to participate in this tender? | International firms having their registered office in India may participate. Amount has to be quoted in INR only, and all payments shall be made in INR only. |
| JN Consultancy & Services | 7 | 2.2 | Bid Security | The Applicant shall submit, along with their Proposal, a Bid Security of Rs.3,00,000 (Rupees Three Lakhs only) for the study/assignment | Can the bid security reduce to Rs 1,00,000/-? | Original clause is retained with no change |

| | | | | | | |
|--|----|--------------|--|--|---|---|
| JN Consultancy & Services | 8 | 2.9.3 | Associate | Associate means, in relation to the Applicant, a person who controls, is controlled by, or is under the common control with such Applicant, or is deemed or published as an "Associate Office"; or has a formal arrangement such as tie up for client referral or technology sharing, joint venture with the Applicant (the "Associate"); provided, however, that if the Applicant has any formal arrangement such as consortium membership in a consortium of advisers/ consultants for a particular assignment/ project, not being this project, with any other person, then such other person shall not be treated to be an Associate of the Applicant solely due to the reason of forming such consortium. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Can Associate (i.e. Sector expert IT and Aviation Expert) be from other the firm? 2. Can Associate (i.e. the firm) enclose a letter of association with the applicant? 3. Can you share a letter of association format or any letter of association will do? | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Please refer to response to query No.4 2. Please refer to response to query No. 4 3. AERA do not have any format. Applicant firm has to submit copy of the agreement with the Associate. |
| | 9 | 2.6.1 (d) | Eligibility criteria -Conditions of Eligibility | The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000 (Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. | Can more than one firm form a Joint Venture /consortium to qualify Rs 5 crore turnover? | Please refer to response to query No. 3. More than one firm forming Consortium/JVs are not allowed. |
| | 10 | 2.6.1 (d) | Eligibility criteria - Conditions of Eligibility | The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000 (Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. | Can the minimum turnover reduce to Rs 2 crores per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years? Our Firm has done Regulatory Audit of Books of Account for the purpose of true up of FY 2016-17. for Delhi Electricity Regulatory Commission | Please refer to response to query No. 3. |
| | 11 | 2.6.1 (e) | Availability of Key Personnel: | The proposed Team Leader and Sector Experts must be employees/ partner of the Applicant at least for the last one year. | Can the team leader/Sector experts be an Associate / Sub consultant with the applicant for the entire tenure of the project? | Please refer to response to query No. 4. |

| | | | | | | |
|---|----|---|---|--|--|---|
| K Venkatachalam Aiyer & Co. Chartered Accountants | 12 | Appendix - I - Form -2 - Clause 1.2 | Particulars of the Applicant | State whether applying as a Sole Proprietorship Firm or Partnership Firm or LLP or Company and provide details of the relevant authorization | What is the meaning of " the relevant authorization " for applying as a firm of Chartered Accountants? | The official signing on behalf of the firm should be duly authorised under Article of Association/ Partnership-deed. |
| | 13 | Appendix - I - Form -2 - Clause 1.3 | Particulars of the Applicant | Principal place of business | What do we state as Principal place of business as firm operates out of 7 branches across the country? The firm has a local branch in New Delhi however its head office is in Kochi where matters of Administration are taken care of. | Place of Head Office may be mentioned. |
| | 14 | Clause 2.6.1 (d) | Financial capacity of the applicant | The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000 (Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. | Our firm does not have the required turnover of Rs. 5 Crores in the year 2015-16. However, we have a turnover of Rs. 6.3 Crores and Rs. 6.6 Crores in the subsequent two financial years. Kindly let us know if we will still be eligible to submit our proposal. We humbly request you to consider our firm eligible to submit a proposal since the cumulative turnover for the last three years is more than 15 Crores and we are confident of delivering quality services since we satisfy all other conditions required for eligibility | Please refer to response to query No.3 |
| K Venkatachalam Aiyer & Co. Chartered Accountants | 15 | Clause 2.5.2 | Particulars of Key personnel | The composition of the Key Personnel shall inter alia include Team Leader and at least 2(two) Sector Experts or such other team members as may be adequate to ensure that prerequisite skills are available to provide all the outputs required from the assignment within the timeframe prescribed | 1) Are two sector experts required? One with knowledge of IT systems and other with a finance background being a CA/MBA for understanding cost structures and cost drivers? 2) Can one sector expert be a consultant and not an employee/ partner with the firm? | Please refer to response of query No. 4. |

| | | | | | | |
|---|----|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|--|---|
| | 16 | Clause 2.6.2 Appendix - I - Form -8 | Experience of the Applicant | Applicant should have assisted at least 1(One) Regulatory Authority or Government Authority in any infrastructure/essential services sector such as aviation, power, gas, telecommunication, shipping, etc., or assisted any regulated entity viz. airport, port, power distribution company, etc. in conduction of studies or audits of similar nature or in related areas, details of which are to be provided in Form 8. | 1) Can the experience of a partner or employee of the firm be taken into consideration or should the past assignment been conducted in the name of the firm? 2) Should documentary evidences be submitted to substantiate firm/employee experience? If yes, what documents need to be furnished? | 1) Original clause is retained with no change. Firm's experience will only be considered. 2) Yes, the related supporting documents should be furnished |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 17 | Clause 2.6.1 (c), Page 13 | Conditions of Eligibility | The Applicant should have minimum 10 (ten) professionals as chartered accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant. | (i) We request the authority to kindly consider for evaluation, qualified CA/ICWA professionals on the payroll of the holding company of the applicant firm also. (ii) In respect of this, we request alteration of the referred clause into the following form – “The applicant should have minimum 10 Chartered Accountant (CA)/ Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the payroll of the applicant/ its holding company.” | (i) Professionals from the holding company can be considered provided holding company takes responsibility for the satisfactory completion of the assignment within the given timeframe. (ii) PI refer to response to query no. 1 wherein the number of professional have been reduced to 5 (five) out of which there should be at least two CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant firm. |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 18 | Clause 2.6.1 (e), Page 14 | Availability of Key Personnel: | <i>“The proposed Team Leader and Sector Experts must be employees/ partner of the Applicant at least for the last one year. The Applicant shall offer the services of only</i> | Based on our prior experience in successfully conducting similar assignments, and requirement being a sector specific expert, we request the authority to kindly allow an | Please refer to response of query No. 4. |

| | | | | | | |
|---|----|-------------------|--|--|--|---|
| | | | | <i>those Key Personnel who fulfil the eligibility requirements specified at (f) and (g) below. “</i> | associate consultant to be eligible for qualification under the Sector Experts category. | |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 19 | Clause 2.6.1. (f) | Financial Accounting, Management Accounting, IT Professionals | | <p>We request authority to consider separate CVs For Finance (Accounting) and IT Professional as both the fields are of different domain. During the tenure of study, experts from both the field shall be required in determination of assets pertaining to IT sector.</p> <p>We request authority to consider following for</p> <p>A. Finance (Accounting) expert: “Minimum of 5 years of experience with MBA (Finance) or equivalent /CMA/ CA.</p> <p>B. IT Expert: Minimum of 5 Years of experience in the field of IT Asset with graduation in engineering.</p> | Please refer to response of query No. 4. |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 20 | Clause 2.6.1. (i) | | <p>“i) The Applicant shall enclose with the Technical proposal, a certificate issued by its Statutory Auditors stating its year wise income against the professional fee during the past three years in the format prescribed at Form 5, Appendix I.</p> | <p>We request the Authority to kindly consider following:</p> <p>The Applicant shall enclose with the Technical proposal, a certificate issued by its Statutory Auditors/ Chartered Accountants stating its year wise income against the professional fee during the past three years in the format prescribed at Form 5, Appendix I.</p> | Please refer to footnote in Form 5, Appendix-I. In case Applicant does not have a statutory auditor, it shall provide the certificate from its chartered accountant who audits the annual accounts of the Applicant firm. |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------------------|----|---|--|---|--|--|------------------|--|--|
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 21 | Clause 4 (Payment Schedule) & Clause 4 of TOR (Deliverable and Payment Milestone) | (Payment Schedule) & Clause 4 of TOR (Deliverable and Payment Milestone) | SI. No. | Deliverables | Time Frame for completion | Payment Schedule | <p>As per Terms of Reference provided in the RFP, we understand following separate category reports to be provided :</p> <p>1. Reports for General Application across Major Airports.</p> <p>2. Report on Delhi Airport Joint Business Agreement with ITJV.</p> <p>3. Report for specific Application in Delhi Airport.</p> <p>4. Report for specific Application in Mumbai Airport.</p> <p>Kind request to provide time line and payment schedule for various deliverable under each categories</p> | <p>(i) There are two RFPs and a separate report has to be submitted for each RFP. The Detailed Report should include submissions for:</p> <p>1. General Application across Major Airports.</p> <p>2. Delhi Airport Joint Business Agreement with ITJV.</p> <p>3. Specific Application in Delhi Airport.</p> <p>4. Specific Application in Mumbai Airport.</p> <p>(ii) Timelines for completion of the assignment is given below:</p> <p>-Initial report and framework preparation: 1.5 month</p> <p>-Draft detailed Project Report: 3 months</p> <p>-Final DPR Submission: <u>1.5 month</u></p> <p>Total period: <u>6 months</u></p> |
| | | | | 1 | Initial report and framework preparation | 6 Months | 10% | | |
| | | | | 2 | Draft Detailed Project Report (DPR) | | 50% | | |
| | | | | 3 | Final DPR Submission | | 40% | | |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | 22 | 2.9 Termination of Agreement 2.9.1. By the Authority | Termination of Agreement By the Authority | <p>The Authority may, by not less than 15 (fifteen) days' written notice of termination to the Consultant, such notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events Specified in this Clause 2.9.1, terminate this Agreement if:</p> <p>The Authority may, by not less than 15 (fifteen) days' written notice of termination to the Consultant, such</p> | | <p>We request the authority to consider the following:</p> <p>"The Authority may, by not less than 30 (thirty) days' written notice of termination to the Consultant, such notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events Specified in this Clause 2.9.1, terminate this Agreement if:</p> <p>The Authority may, by not less than</p> | | <p>Agreed for modification. The modified clause be read read as under:</p> <p>"The Authority may, by not less than 30 (thirty) days' written notice of termination to the Consultant, such notice to be given after the</p> | |

| | | | | | |
|---|-----|--|--|--|---|
| | | | notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events Specified in this Clause 2.9.1, terminate this Agreement. | 30 (Thirty) days' written notice of termination to the Consultant, such notice to be given after the occurrence of any of the events Specified in this Clause 2.9.1, terminate this Agreement." | occurrence of any of the events specified in this Clause 2.9.1, terminate this Agreement if:" |
| | | Request for Addition in RFP by M/s CRISIL | | | |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | (1) | We request the Authority to kindly incorporate the following statement in the contract to be signed, post selection of the Consultant. <i>"Notwithstanding anything to the contrary, the aggregate maximum liability of the Consultant shall not exceed the fees received by the Consultant under this Work Order."</i> | | | Agreed but the maximum liability of the Consultant shall not exceed the total value of the contract. The clause be read as under: <i>"Notwithstanding anything to the contrary, the aggregate maximum liability of the Consultant shall not exceed the total value of the contract."</i> |
| M/s CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory | (2) | We request authority to add following clause: <i>AERA acknowledges that all right, title and interest in the methodologies, processes, techniques, ideas, concepts, trade secrets and know-how of the Consultant continue to remain those of the Consultant even if any of them is embodied in the reports, developed or supplied in connection with the Services. AERA shall have the non-exclusive perpetual licence to use the reports to the extent necessary for the Client to use the reports in accordance with this Contract.</i> | | | Agreed. The clause be read as under: <i>"AERA acknowledges that all right, title and interest in the methodologies, processes, techniques, ideas, concepts, trade secrets and know-how of the Consultant continue to remain those of the Consultant even if any of them is embodied in the reports, developed or</i> |

| | | | | | <i>supplied in connection with the Services. AERA shall have the non-exclusive perpetual licence to use the reports to the extent necessary for the Client to use the reports in accordance with this Contract."</i> | |
|--|-----------|------------|-----------------------------|--|--|-------------------------------------|
| Name of Bidder | Query No. | RFP Clause | | | Bidders Query | Remarks / Suggestions |
| | | Clause No. | Name | Text requiring clarification | | |
| KITCO Ltd. | 23 | | | Enquire whether Consortium/JV is allowed or not. | We request the authority to allow Joint Venture mode of participation in tender. | Consortium /JVs are not permitted. |
| | 24 | | Clause 2.6.1 (c) Page 13 | The Applicant should have minimum 10 professionals as Chartered Accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant. Or Out of 10 professionals there should be 6 CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (FIN) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant. | We request the authority so that Applicant should have minimum 10 professionals as Chartered Accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) or "MBA". | PI refer to response to query No.1. |
| Mercados Energy Market India Pvt. Ltd. | 25 | 1.2 | Request For Proposals | "The applicant applying in response to this invitation can be a sole proprietorship firm or partnership firm or LLP or company." | Can the Applicant be a Joint Venture / Consortium / Associate (as defined in clause 2.9.3 of the RFP | Consortium /JVs are not permitted. |

| | | | | | | |
|---|----|-----------|-------------------------------|---|---|---|
| | 26 | 2.6.1 (c) | Conditions of Eligibility | <p>The Applicant should have minimum 10 (ten) professionals as chartered accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant.</p> <p>Or</p> <p>Out of 10 professionals there should be 6 CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant.</p> | <p>(a) The Consultant is bound to provide a minimum of three key personnel with the requisite qualifications to perform as per the terms of the RFP and Agreement. In light of such requirement, soliciting minimum 10 professionals as CA / ICWA or 6 CAs and 4 ICWA / MBA (Fin) may not be required. A minimum of 5 CA / ICWA / MBA (Fin) is suggested.</p> <p>(b) The Consultant proposes to fulfil said eligibility criteria through formation of Consortium as per terms defined in clause 2.9.3</p> | <p>a) PI refer to response to query No.1.</p> <p>b) Consortium /JVs are not permitted</p> |
| Mercados Energy Market India Pvt. Ltd. | 27 | | Conditions of Eligibility | <p>The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000 (Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years.</p> | <p>(a) It is suggested that an Applicant with average turnover of Rs 5,00,00,000 (Rs Five Crores) in last three years may be considered eligible for participation.</p> | <p>Please refer to response of query No. 3</p> |
| Mercados Energy Market India Pvt. Ltd. | 28 | 3.1.1 | Technical Proposal Evaluation | Marking Criteria | <p>It is requested that the AERA may kindly provide an objective break-up of the marking criteria</p> | <p>Original clause is retained with no change.</p> |

| | | | | | | |
|------|----|-------|--------------------------------------|---|--|---|
| KPMG | 29 | 2.6.1 | Conditions of Eligibility | <p>1) Team leader with CMA/CA/MBA (F)/PGDBA and MBA qualification from reputed institute with minimum of 7 years of experience.</p> <p>2) Aviation Expert with CMA/CA/MBA (Fin)/PGDBM in Finance from premier institutes with minimum of 7 years of experience.</p> <p>3) Financial Accounting, Management Accounting, IT professionals with Graduate Engineer with degree in Finance from premier institutes /CMA/CA/ MBA (Fin) with minimum of 5 years of experience.</p> | <p>We request the Authority to also allow Ph.D. or equivalent education qualification for the position of Team Leader, Aviation Expert and Sector Expert. Our Global Lead of Airports has a Ph. D. in Transport Economics and has undertaken several relevant projects such as drafting of National Civil Aviation Policy (2016), civil aviation policy for Andhra Pradesh, business plan and transaction advisory for NMIA (the largest greenfield airport), Mopa (Goa), Bhogapuram, Dagadarthi and Singrauli Airport, etc.</p> <p>Ph. D. or equivalent education qualification of the experts has been allowed in recent tenders of central government agencies.</p> | The original clause is retained with no change. |
| | 30 | 3.1.1 | Technical Proposal Evaluation | A. Firm's relevant experience for the assignment | We propose to the Authority to specify 10 marks out of 25 marks for study undertaken in the last 10 years on Activity Based Costing in aviation sector and econometric modelling for airport cost benchmark. | The original clause is retained with no change. |

| | | | | | | |
|--|----|---|---|----------------------------|--|---|
| | 31 | 3 | Schedule I – Terms of references | Scope of study/ Assignment | <p>In the current scope of work released by AERA, the deliverables include both the general recommendations for major airport and those for Delhi and Mumbai Airport. General recommendations for major airports should form part of the guidelines of AERA for determination of tariffs under hybrid till. Therefore, application of such guidelines should happen only after the release of such guidelines to avoid any biases towards any specific airport and it should be undertaken as a separate project so that the process is transparent and applicable to any airport. For example, the study on the normative benchmarks was done before applying its recommendations to a specific airport.</p> <p>Hence, we request the Authority to limit this RFP to recommendations applicable to all major airports rather than specific airports. The recommendations can be segregated for different types of airports in the study such as hub airports, major international airports, low cost etc.</p> | The original clause is retained with no change. |
|--|----|---|---|----------------------------|--|---|

| Queries regarding RFP No. 2/2018-19 dated 27.11.2018 “For Engagement of consultant for for Determination of the efficient Operation and Maintenance costs (Delhi and Mumbai). | | | | | | |
|--|------------------|-------------------|-------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| Name of Bidder | Query No. | Clause No. | Name | Text requiring Clarification | Bidders Query | Remarks / Suggestions |
| R Subramanian and Company LLP | 32 | -- | -- | -- | What is the minimum number of sector experts we are required to engage | Please refer to response to query No. 4. |
| | 33 | -- | -- | -- | Can a team leader also be counted as a Sector Expert | Please refer to response to query No. 4. |
| | 34 | -- | -- | -- | Should the details of the 'team members other than key personnel' be disclosed in the technical bid. | Details of Key Personnel/Team member are required to be furnished as per Forms of Annexure-I which are part of Technical Bid. |

| Queries regarding RFP No. 3/2018-19 dated 27.11.2018 “For Engagement of consultant for Determination of Allocation of Assets between Aeronautical and Non-Aeronautical activities (Delhi and Mumbai Airport). | | | | | | |
|--|------------------|-------------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| Name of Bidder | Query No. | Clause No. | Name | Text requiring Clarification | Bidders Query | Remarks / Suggestions |
| T R Chadha & Co LLP, Chartered Accountants. | 35 | 2.6.1 (a) & B, Page no.13 | Eligibility Criteria- Conditions of Eligibility | a) In order to be eligible to submit the RFP, an Applicant should have assisted at least 1(One) Regulatory Authority or Government Authority in any infrastructure/essential services sector such as aviation, power, gas, | Any time bound for the assignments? | The Applicant should have assisted at least 1 (one) Regulatory Authority or Government Authority in any infrastructure/essential services sector such as aviation, power, gas, telecommunication, |

| | | | | | | |
|--|----|---------------------|----------------------|---|--|---|
| | | | | <p>telecommunication, shipping, etc., or assisted any regulated entity viz. airport, port, power distribution company, etc. in conduction of studies or audits of similar nature or in related areas, details of which are to be provided in Form 8.</p> <p>b) The fact that the Applicant has participated as a consultant or auditor or employee in any of the above projects or assignments specifically relating to airport infrastructure and for other aeronautical services shall be provided appropriate weightage as per the scheme of technical evaluation (refer to Clause 3.1).</p> | | <p>shipping, etc., or assisted any regulated entity viz. airport, port, power distribution company, etc. in conduction of studies or audits of similar nature or in related areas during last 7 (seven) years.</p> |
| T R Chadha & Co LLP, Chartered Accountants. | 36 | 2.9.1 Page no.15 | Conflict of Interest | An Applicant shall not have a conflict of interest that may affect the Selection Process or the Consultancy ("Conflict of Interest"). AERA requires the Consultant to provide professional, objective and impartial advice and at all times hold AERA's | 1. Our Firm was nominated by Delhi International Airport Limited (DIAL) in June 2018 , to conduct the revenue audit for the 7 concessionaires , pertaining to non-Aero division, having various outlets at Delhi Airport terminals. These concessionaires were required to submit these revenue audit report to DIAL on quarterly basis in order to ensure that the Royalty charged by DIAL was based upon | This is considered as Conflict of Interest. |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|---|---|
| | | | | <p>interests paramount and avoid Conflict of Interest with any other assignment. Without limitation on the generality of the foregoing, the Consultant or any of its Associates shall not take up any assignment that by its nature will result in conflict with the present assignment i.e., during the period of this assignment and for a period of 1 (one) year thereafter. It is further clarified that during the aforementioned period of consultancy, the selected Consultant shall not accept any assignment of similar nature or any audit/consulting/advisory service from the airports specified in Schedule-1 or any other service provider /ISP/concessionaire operating at the airports mentioned in Schedule-1 for which the work has been assigned to the Consultant. Whereas, a similar engagement for any other regulator (viz. Central government in the case of airports other than major airports) may not be</p> | <p>the correct revenue values and was in line with the contract.</p> <p>In respect of this assignment, the audit fees to our firm(TRC) was paid by concessionaire itself and concessionaire is also allowed to get the audit done from any of the Big 4, if in case they do not opt TRC to carry out the assignment. The term of appointment has been agreed for a period of 3 years i.e. from 1 April 2018 to 31 March 2021, subject to revision of appointment.</p> <p>2.Our firm was also appointed as Statutory Auditors of MIAL – Passenger Service Fee (PSF) -Security Component - Escrow Account for the FY 2017-18 & 2018-19. PSF report is meant for Airport Authority of India (AAI) and does not consolidated in MIAL financial as it is not a part of MIAL.</p> <p>3.Our firm is appointed as GST auditor for Financial year 17-18 by Airports Authority of India</p> <p><u>Please let us know whether above would be considered as conflict of interest under clause 2.9 “conflict of interest” which includes the consultant would not accept the audits in future and the</u></p> |
|--|--|--|--|---|---|

| | | | | | | |
|--|----|---|----------------------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | so construed as conflict of interest. In case the bidder dealing with the statutory audit / advisory services on tariff matter of the specific airport, it shall be treated as direct conflict of interest. | <u>clause is silent about present arrangement.</u> | |
| T R Chadha & Co LLP, Chartered Accountants. | 37 | Page 1 of Corrigendum to RFP Nos. 2/2018-19 and 03/2018-19 dated 27.11.2018 | Pre Bid conference | Pre Bid conference dated 08.01.2019 | Timing for pre bid conference | Date and time was already notified on AERA's website on 04.01.2019 |
| Seth & Associates | 38 | 2.9.3 | Request for proposal | that if the Applicant has any formal arrangement such as consortium membership in a consortium of advisers/ consultants for a particular assignment/ project, not being this project, with any other person, then such other person shall not be treated to be an Associate of the Applicant solely due to the reason of forming such consortium | Would a consortium be allowed to apply for the tender ? | Consortium/JVs are not permitted |
| Seth & Associates | 39 | 2.6.1.c | Conditions for eligibility | The Applicant should have minimum 10 (ten) professionals as chartered accountants (CA) or Cost Accountant (ICWA) on the pay roll of the Applicant. OR Out of 10 professionals there should | A firm has 7 CA partners. Would that firm be eligible ? | Please refer to response to query No.1. |

| | | | | | | |
|------------------------------|----|---------|----------------------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | be 6 CAs and rest can be ICWA or MBA (Fin) from a premier institute on the pay roll of the Applicant. | | |
| Seth & Associates | 40 | 2.6.1.d | Conditions for eligibility | The Applicant should have a minimum turnover of Rs. 5,00,00,000(Rupees Five Crores) per annum under the head of professional fees during each of the last three accounting years. For avoidance of doubt, professional fees here under refers to fees earned by the Applicant for providing advisory or consultancy services to its clients. | a. As per tender practice this should be Rs. 5 crore average turnover over last three years. b. It would be prudent to define advisory and consultancy services to remove any ambiguity. | Please refer to response to query No. 3 |